MEMORY. ISSUE 28 . DECEMBER 2022. ₹500



RNI NO.DELENG/2015/60525

Myall ma



Editor & Publisher

Bhavna Kakai

Editorial Manage

\_\_\_\_\_\_

Faris Kallayi

Editorial Consultant
Tanya Dutt

Design & Layout

Vivek Premachandran

Subscription & Accounts
Surender Kumar

Warehouse Assistant Rafeek Khan

#### Nihaal Faizal's intervention on cover page

Apart from TAKE's very first issue (Volume 1 Issue 1: Black), the magazine's mastheads have always appeared on the top left corner of the cover page. For TAKE's 28th issue on memory, the artist Nihaal Faizal returns the cover page masthead to the top right—a position it fleetingly and briefly occupied just once before, in its initial launch issue.

#### **Cover Image:**

One of the envelopes on which Mahatma Gandhi wrote notes at his meeting with Lord Mountbatten, 2 June 1947. Displayed as a part of the exhibition *Tangled Hierarchy* curated by Jitish Kallat at John Hansard Gallery, part of the University of Southampton, the UK. With the kind permission of the University of Southampton.

TAKE on Art magazine is published and printed by Bhavna Kakar for and on behalf of the owners, M/s Latitude 28. Published at F–208, First Floor, Opposite HDFC Bank, Lado Sarai, New Delhi–110030, India.

© Take on Art Publishing Pvt. Ltd., New Delhi, India. All rights reserved. Reproduction in whole or in part without written permission is strictly prohibited. All prices are correct at the time of printing, but are subject to change.

Printed at Naveen Printers, New Delhi

Price: ₹500

takeonartmag@gmail.com

Instagram @takeonar

website takeonartmagaz

onartmagazine.com @takeon

### **Contents**

32. - Bhavna Kakar Editor's Note

36. Essay - Geeta Kapur

Representational ethics, the hidden face, and the work of memory

40. Essay - Salima Hashmi and Neelam Hussain Letter from Lahore: An exchange between Neelam Hussain and Salima Hashmi (2016-2022)

44. Essay - Tapati Guha-Thakurta A Dacca Childhood: On Photographs and Family Memories

52. Essay - Deepra Dandekar Recreating and Embodying Lahore in Delhi

58. Essay - Iftikhar Dadi 1947 Partition and the Art of Zarina

62. Essay - Natasha Ginwala Terrasonic Agency: Working the Earth

68. Essay - Manuela Ciotti (Post)memory Democracy Remembering Partition through Emergent Visual-Material Objects

74. Essay - Nubras Samayeen
The Landscape of 1971:
Museums, Memories, and the
Aesthetics of Bangladeshi Nationalism

80. Essay - Katja Müller
Digital Archives and the
Crowdsourcing of the Past

86. Essay- Kanika Sharma and Zuleikha Chaudhari Re: Staging the Trial of Bahadur Shah Zafar (1858)

90. Essay - Dilpreet Bhullar Afterlives of the Constant Past in the Photographs from Kashmir: Rematerializing Space dotted by Mediation and Inscription

98. Essay - Ananya Jahanara Kabir Creole Indias and the Artistic Activation of Memory

104. Essay - Jacque Micieli-Voutsinas Partition Anti-Memorial Project: Resisting Political Appropriation through Feminist Art 112. Essay - Aditi Kumar

Intergenerational Memories of 1947 Partition: The South Asian Diaspora in the United Kingdom

116. Essay - Arushi Vats

'The Contrarieties in our Longings'\*: Mohammed Rafi Fan Blog

122. Essay - Damian Christinger

A Memorial for a Harvest: Dharmendra Prasad's Museum of Grass

128. Review - Dilpreet Bhullar

Bani Abidi: Revisit the Many Haunts Borne by Unsung Warriors of the First World War

130. Review - Aparna Andhare Listening to Lines: Encountering Nasreen Mohamedi

131. Review - Shruti Ramlingaiah Of Separation and Belonging: Sayed Haider Raza

133. Review - Aparna Andhare Review of 'Event, Memory, Metaphor'

135. Review - Oindrilla Maity
Beyond the Dark Edge: Exploring the

137. Review - Ranu Roychoudhuri
The Street and the Gallery:
Shahidul Alam's Archives of Practices

Nuanced World of Arunima Choudhury

140. Review - Najrin Islam
Between Warp and Weft:
On Kallol Datta's Textile Objects

142. Review - Georgina Maddox

The World Expressed Through Diverse Mediums and in Different Voices

144. Review - Alka Pande

The Milk of Dreams: 59th Venice Biennale

146. Review - Aditi Kumar

The Universe in Me, I Am the Universe

147. Review - Saloni

'Jitish Kallat: Order of Magnitude'

152. Report - Premjish Achari

Field Report of a Cultural Worker's Residency in Basel, Switzerland

158. Book Review - Girish Shahane

A City Through Objects - 101 Stories from the Dr. Bhau Daji Lad Museum

160. Book Review - Dev Nath Pathak Navjot At Work and Artist's Notes

163. Book Review - Sandhya Bordewekar Modernism/Murderism: The Modern Art Debate in Kumar

165. Book Review - Radhika Chopra Splendors of Punjab: Art from the Khanuja Family Collection

167. Book Review - Cheryl Mukherji Let's See

170. Book Review - Najrin Islam Guftgu

174. Interview - Girish Shahane in conversation with Manisha Gera Baswani Connecting the Dots of Memory

178. Interview - Lina Vincent in conversation with Subodh Kerkar Metaphor and Memory

184. Interview - Bhavna Kakar in conversation with Anjani Kumar Singh A Repository of Rich Indian Art finds a New Life in Bihar Museum

188. Interview - Pratap Bose in conversation with Priya Khanna Preserved and Framed

**194. Interview** - Soledad Gutiérrez Rodríguez in conversation with Himali Singh Soin and David Soin Tappeser

The Memory of Ice

198. Photo Essay- Manisha Gera Baswani Fly on the Wall

**202.** Photo Essay- Jitish Kallat Tangled Hierarchy

206. TAKE Pick

TAKE Symposium
What Future Hides:
Writing Critically In/For a

**Changing Nation** 

**Artists' Intervention** 

**35.** Amitesh Grover **86.** Arpana Caur

111. Sheba Chhachhi

151. Nilima Sheikh

157. Apnavi Makanji



Above: Installation view, 'S. H. Raza | Zamin: Homelands'

material from the Raza Foundation the show is curated by Puja Vaish, Director of the JNAF, and ran from 2 June-31 July 2022. The show incorporates texts that are informative, touching anecdotes using letters—written and received—and notes written in Devanagari, French, and English tell of the artist's assimilation of languages, and varied knowledge of art, literature, poetry and cultures.

Raza was born and raised in a small town in Madhya Pradesh where his father was a forest ranger. His experiences and memories of growing up close to nature and the environment later churned into his incessant brushstroke and dripping in the 70s. The exhibition's title is taken from a 1971 oil on canvas painting titled *Zamina* phenomenal gestural workbeams of yellow, orangish red, and green screams from behind the aggregating black fluid that barely cohere of imagery in our eye. While in France during 1960s and 70s, Raza revisited the forest landscapes in India bringing defining compilations from remembered residues of his mind. Almost notating the mild conversations heard from a distance or fiery flames visible in the middle of the night.

During 1948-55, Raza turned dramatically lyrical watercolours on paper to paradigms in landscapes—works such as *Houses with Medieval Church, Church at Meulen, Mosque* being good examples. These works trace diversities in rectilinear views and feature structures drawn from an aerial vantage in the delightful diagonal brushwork. With blocks and broken lines on ochre and brownish grey ground or sky- these architectural constructs sometimes are a dense mass of black, unsubstantial structures, cubist contours or tin-like translucent flatness of burnt sienna, grey and ochres that occupy the blazing ground but, with no specifics of time and place. Scenes in graphite where Raza indefinitely

erases and draws (leaving the lines visible than removing them with an eraser), where lines multiply to construct. A few contours define the wall, roof and depth of the structures that hint at the window or door - a pictorial frame looks cohesive as a picture but hardly situates one location in the viewer's mind.

Traced in a scene, Untitled (1952) gouache on paper has a burnt sienna sphere that looms large between the disproportionate structures suspended in cosmic space-it appears like twin cities were split, while they share a sun or a moon telling a mythical tale of light and darkness. As we move through the exhibition, a black dot (we imagine we know so much about it, yet we struggle with its presence) is cosmically framed in the middle of a square, moving, forwarding (in its entirety always) across the plane. Raza's late works develop many forms of this dotfrom an orb in a landscape to a circle, mass, or sun, embedded amid a tile-like mosaic which at times relocates across the plane. The show culminates with a work titled Amar Kantak (1998) with verso text that reads, 'Amarkantak, Mandala, Kakaiya, Dindori, Niwas, Satpuda, Vindhyachal, Narmada, Narsinghpur... my thoughts and life forces are driven by these (places). Eternal memories. In gratitude to my homeland -Raza.' Names of these places variously suggest sites of pilgrimage, where mountains collide, rivers meet, and saints had resided. If not human-like, the dot emanates a humanising effect on us as we constantly follow its path in the exhibition.

The artist moved away from pictorial constructions in the mid-1950s to experiment with the forms of abstractions—rising from substantial, tangible traces of buildings to attain a full circle to culminate in symbol, motif, geometry which is predictable of a matured seeker in a person. In the show, the artist's most prodigious works are of the 70s—where he revisits memories in most discomforting brush strokes—in fleeting blobs and dashes across the canvas. The artist's experiences of nature and land emanate in colours and emotions that echoe his calling in loss and longing for his homeland.

'S.H. Raza | Zamin: Homelands', Curated by Puja Vaish, Jehangir Nicholson Art Foundation, Mumbai, 2 June-31 July 2022.

# **Review**

04 - Mumbai

### **REVIEW OF 'EVENT, MEMORY, METAPHOR'**

Aparna Andhare



**Above:** Garima Gupta, *Cassiterite (Cornwall)*, Colour pencils, Graphite on Archiva paper, Copier paper, Gateway paper and Rice paper, 8 x 16 inches, 2021. Photo Courtesy: Garima Gupta and TARO.

'Event, Memory, Metaphor' has all the elements needed for an enthralling art show, responding to contemporary struggles and the changing nature of the way archives are created, accessed and interpreted. A multi-artist, multi-medium show at Tarq, in Mumbai, curated by Anish Gawande, the exhibition is an assemblage of artworks that speak to each other, that shout and argue but very respectfully, of course.

Artworks in the show reiterate that the personal is inextricably political; the world is a tangled mess,

and we are all connected in several sticky ways. The making of history, its recollection and retelling links us all, and affects us as individuals and society. A seemingly humble bag suspended from the ceiling encapsulates Areez Katki's family history, with parts forgotten, the textile mill production of large companies like Wadia Group's Bombay Dyeing, and the gendered perceptions of skills and techniques such as embroidery. On the other hand, Garima Gupta's light boxes make a commentary on the natural world being categorised and taxonomies set up by colonisers. She takes an archive from a university in America and reclaims it, attempting to decolonise the material and its analysis, bringing to the fore the violence that enabled the creation of the 'archive' in the first place.

Writing is on the wall, quite literally, but in two very different ways: Saubiya Chasmawala and Muzzumil Ruheel both work with calligraphy. Using Arabic letters, Chasmawala creates patterns, reminiscent of monumental Kufic writing, exploring the form and grace of the line. This repetition of form can be seen as prayer or practice. Her engagement is self-critical, and unavoidably entangled, even as her lines drum up a rhythm. When has the engagement with faith or spirituality been straightforward? Ruheel, on the other hand, turns forms of historical writing on its head, obscuring meaning, turning the page into a chequerboard, and the act of comprehension into a perilous game.

A group show always runs the risk of turning into a hodgepodge, but Gawande uses the gallery space to his advantage, creating small pods, allowing the viewer enough breathing and thinking spaceperhaps most poignantly in the location of one of Parag Tandel's sculptures placed at the back, near a window. Tandel tells the story of the Koli community. The Kolis are a fishing community, and the original inhabitants of Bombay. With unbridled urbanisation, the community is now being literally pushed out of their homes and their livelihood is being systematically destroyed. Bridges, buildings, and the complete lack of sensitivity towards the environment is reflected in the tarpaulin blue sculpture, itself very delicate. The precarious nature of home is also central to Saju Kunhan's work, as he works with fragmented tiles from his ancestral house. The impulse to hold on to pieces, and recreating the past is deeply moving. Like Kunhan's tiles, Tandel's Into the Bones is a set of sculptures that look like fossils, shards of the past, rescued from rubble and earth and uncovered in



Above: Installation view, 'Event, Memory, Metaphor', Curated by Anish Gawande, Targ, Mumbai Photo Courtesv: TARO.

Tandel's sculptures sparkle and catch the eye, shining like beacons, announcing an emergency-this is a cry of help, an urgent call to conserve, and to protect, before it is too late.

The archive, ever present and silently building, is at the heart of this show. Tandel makes a book and records how Koli women are adapting in Ek Bahal Mein Chand Hoga, Ek Bagal Mein Rotiyan, while Philippe Calia with Cloud Atlas makes cyanotypes which document natural resources and geographies that are source elements in most objects we use, including devices that physically store information. The vivid blue of Cloud Atlas questions the materiality of (even digital) information, and actions that eventually destroy the planet.

Destruction, in its most obvious and train-wreck glory, forms the core of Sameer Kulavoor's Read & Resist, and JCB. These are images we have seen several times on our phones and in newspapers. He depicts protests, atrocities and politics being actively recorded, and encourages a vocal political stance in his large ironically cheerful style. Most pressing

excavations. Using natural elements and brass, causes are recorded in realistically comical panels, and he sets up a moral compass for walking towards justice in a dystopian, crumbling world.

> The show is as much about its curatorial framework and the scholarship it references, as it is about the artworks. Anisha Gawande brings together a range of disciplines, including borrowing the title from noted historian Shahid Amin. This well-researched approach encourages viewers to deliberate over how an incident turns into history. Not all archives are written, not all stories are told, not all significant issues are articulated but the slippery past and its implications can be captured in art, creating an aesthetic experience that moves, delights, and even frustrates. Anish Gawande has created a layered narrative of visual and textual material that makes the unsaid quite apparent.

'Event, Memory, Metaphor', Curated by Anish Gawande, Tarq Mumbai, 14 July- 24 September 2022

# **Review**

05 - Kolkata

### **BEYOND THE DARK EDGE: EXPLORING THE NUANCED WORLD OF ARUNIMA CHOUDHURY**

Oindrilla Maity



**Above:** Arunima Choudhury, *Landscape in Red*, Acrylic on canvas, 24.02 x 24.02 inches, 2018. Photo Courtesy: Emami Art.

In the visual art circuit of Kolkata Arunima Choudhury's presence has always been non-intrusive and yet persistent. Like William Wordsworth's solitary Lucy Gray-character from the eponymous poem-she is perhaps "The sweetest Thing that ever grew/Beside a human door!" We are yet to discover her other side: her ever-curious mind which constantly seeks to transcend social taboo, patriarchy and female stereotypes; her expansive vocabulary of the process of life and death; her experience of transience and permanence and her broad awareness of the environment. Therefore, an exhaustive collection of her work of over four hundred paintings from 1995 to 2022, reaching a retrospectivelevel exhibition titled 'The Dark Edge of Green' and curated by Nancy Adajania ( at Emami Art, Kolkata, June-August, 2022) is a rediscovery of the artist who creates a world in which she reckons "...sadness is not the end of anything. There begins new hope; new light; new sunshine..."

Arunima Choudhury (b. 1950, Siliguri, West Bengal) studied painting at The Indian College of Art and Draftsmanship, and design and mass communication

at Chitrabani, Kolkata, throughout the Deeply inspired by the post-Tagore Bengali poets Jibanananda Das, Bishnu Dey, Buddhadeb Basu, Shakti Chattopadhyay, and the Hungryalist movement, she is a true reflection of the cultural psyche of the Nehruvian era in Bengal. Nancy Adajania introduces the exhibition as one in which the artist's work 'expresses nurturing fecund generative female principal' However, instead of looking at Choudhury's work through the rubric of 'woman and nature', which appear as a recurrent motif in the work, Adajania attempts to look beyond the reductive and unitary conception about women-a finding that continues to echo through her latest curatorial venture 'Woman is as Woman Does' (2022). Explored from the deeper and more complex aspects, Adajania discovers the archetypal impulses from the subconscious, which set Arunima free from sexual and social inhibitions; she discovers the artist's complete freedom in her work and it is this joyous element that the curator draws our attention to.

Choudhury's work is not just an illustration of nature but is expressed through the manifestation of the artisanal and ethical choice, journeying through which Adajania is reminded of the American poet Forrest Gander's idea that ecopoetics is 'not just about using nature as one's subject matter.' Ecopoetics is connected to the world in a way that implies responsibility-an aspect that the spectator hardly misses in the artist's work. The paintings raise questions about life at every level. Adajania's take on Choudhury is akin to what the journal Ecopoetics did to the term ecopoetics by broadening it from poetry into poiesis.



Above: Arunima Choudhury, Beastly Games and Other Love Stories X, Vegetable colour on acid-free handmade paper, 14.76 X 17.72 inches, 2009. Photo